

Response to Comments on Component Study

MARINE FISH AND FISH HABITAT COMPONENT STUDY ADDENDUM

Prepared For:

Department of Environment and Conservation

4th Floor, West Block Confederation Building P.O. Box 8700 St. John's, NL A1B 4J6

Prepared By:

Newfoundland and Labrador Refining Corporation

87 Water St Harvey Building, 2nd Floor St. John's, NL A1C 1A5

October 2007

Newfoundland and Labrador Refinery Project EIS Marine Fish and Fish Habitat Component Study Response to Comments

DFO – HES has reviewed the above documents and recommended acceptance provided NLRC addresses the comment noted below.

1. In the Marine Fish and Fish Habitat Component Study (Commercial Fisheries), Section 4.0/General Summaries:

"This section indicates that a traditional lobster fishery was the only fishery identified within Zone 1, 2, 3 or 4 and that based on conversation with local fisher people no commercial fishery for lumpfish, capelin or scallop is being prosecuted within the boundaries of the project. Please provide details as to the public consultation undertaken to determine key fishing activities within the project area.

According to FFAW harvesting data provided to DFO by NLRC during a July 3, 2007 meeting, harvesting of other species which include, cod, capelin, blackback, lumpfish, mackerel, herring, squid, scallop and urchin also occur within the area. Was this data included when fishing activities within the project area were evaluated?"

NLRC Response:

NLRC has successfully addressed DFO-HES concerns with respect to commercial fisheries prosecuted within the marine footprint of the project as shown below:

Letter of Clarification to DFO

NLRC forwarded a letter to Marvin Barnes (Regional Manager, Environmental Assessment and Major Projects, Oceans and Habitat Management Branch) on October 5. 2007. The letter was entitled:

Further clarification of commercial fishing/fisheries resources with respect to the marine habitat quantification and HADD determination within the marine footprint of a proposed oil refinery to be situated at Southern Head, Placentia Bay, NL.

This letter contained the following informational sources which all provided additional support for the original assertion that the only current (and potential) commercially exploited species within the project footprint was lobster:

 further contextualization of the methodology and results obtained from the FFAW commercial fisheries summary;

- additional site-specific commercial fisheries information garnered from local fishers who fish commercially within the marine footprint of the project;
- information garnered from interviews with local DFO Fishery Officers (Placentia Detachment) with respect to commercial fisheries prosecuted within the marine footprint of the project; and
- information collected from the DFO CCRI (Coastal Community Resource Inventory) website with respect to historical marine species distributions in the project area and their associated commercial fisheries

NLRC received an official response on October 17, 2007 via a phone call from Marvin Barnes (Regional Manager, Environmental Assessment and Major Projects, Oceans and Habitat Management Branch, DFO) stating that the October 5, 2007 submission adequately addressed DFO's concerns and that all parties are in agreement with respect to the assertion that lobster is currently the only species commercially fished within the proposed marine footprint of the project.

Revised Fish Habitat Compensation Strategy

A revised compensation strategy document (Newfoundland and Labrador Refinery Project, Southern Head, Placentia Bay, NL, Marine Compensation Strategy) was submitted to DFO Oceans and Habitat Management Branch in September, 2007.

The revised strategy included additional information with respect to current and historical commercial fisheries and fish resources within the project marine footprint. The information presented was "based upon consultations with local fisherpersons, some of whom have fished within the project footprint in excess of forty years".

The resubmitted strategy document reiterated the conclusions of the previous strategy submission in that the only commercially prosecuted fishery within the project marine footprint is for lobster and the only other species historically (but not currently) fished within the project marine footprint was cod.

The revised strategy document also confirmed that the majority of the species indicated as being fished within the project marine footprint by the FFAW maps (blackback, capelin, lumpfish, mackerel, herring, squid, scallop, and urchins) were never (within the last 40+ years) commercially fished within the project marine footprint. Exploratory/experimental fisheries have been intermittently attempted within the project marine footprint for scallop, lumpfish, and urchin, but the species abundances were deemed to be to low for commercial exploitation. Local fishers also supported the conclusions of the submitted Marine Habitat Characterization document with respect to fisheries resources that were present in commercially exploitable abundances (lobster).