ANNEX F

Detailed Examination of Other Jurisdictions

Detailed Examination of Other Jurisdictions

One of the objectives of this evaluation is to inform the development of an approach to the support for adult literacy programming in the province. Research was conducted on the approach taken in four other jurisdictions. These jurisdictions were selected with the input of the steering committee as representing different ways of delivering and funding programming. The following section describes the approach to provision of adult basic literacy in these four provinces. In each case the organizational structure, program delivery model, funding levels and sources, other supports, and perceived strengths and challenges for each approach are identified.

In all cases, the information was obtained through telephone interviews with the lead provincial government manager for adult literacy programs. In Nova Scotia and Manitoba, interviews were also held with selected providers.

NOVA SCOTIA

Organization Structure

The Department of Education's Community Learning Initiative (CLI) was initiated in 1994 as a province-wide response to the literacy and upgrading needs of adult learners and is an example of a community and government partnership at work. Literacy and upgrading programs are supported through a system of 27 community-based Networks and a Provincial Advisory Committee.

What began as an 18-month initiative is now an established community-based adult literacy and upgrading delivery model for Nova Scotia. These 27 Learning Networks provide more than 140 programs and serve more than twenty-one hundred adult learners in Nova Scotia. There are between 600 and 800 volunteers who tutor or assist with the programming or assist with the network, whether it is as a board member or help out in the office. The initiative employs more than 150 tutor coordinator and instructors.

Many Learning Networks are regionally based and develop programs that reflect the needs of their geographic areas. Other networks are designed specifically for the province's diverse communities: Acadian, African-Canadian, deaf, English as a Second Language (ESL), and Mi'Kmaq.

The CLI Networks are supported by a range of agencies, groups and organizations (e.g., cultural groups, school boards, literacy councils, community college campuses, libraries, businesses,

unions, visible minorities, community groups and other stakeholders).

These networks identify the learning needs of adults in their communities. They also develop a wide variety of literacy and upgrading opportunities that target every segment of society. The Nova Scotia Adult Basic Education (ABE) program serves as a basis for programming. The exceptions are the Acadian and ESL communities, which have their own curriculum due to their unique language needs.

Through a *Letter of Agreement*, all Networks are recognized by the Department of Education as representing the community they serve.

The goals of the Community Learning Initiative involve:

- delivering quality literacy and upgrading programs throughout Nova Scotia by providing a coordinated delivery model for adult learners
- promoting awareness of the important role that literacy and lifelong learning play in the development of healthy and sustainable communities, and
- facilitating the development of partnerships within communities and supporting lifelong learning for adults.

The Roles of the Department of Education and the Learning Networks

The Adult Education section of the Department of Education maintains the multiple roles and supports the Community Learning Initiative by providing:

- grants for salary costs of tutor coordinators and instructors, and for administrative needs;
- curriculum guidelines and standards;
- training through the Tutor and Instructor Training and Certification Program;
- professional development, information sharing and networking;
- access to educational resources;
- program advice through Department staff; and
- monitoring and evaluation of programs and services.

The Community Learning Network's role involves:

- promoting and advancing literacy and lifelong learning;

- conducting needs assessments and outreach within communities to determine the number, location, and learning levels of adults who wish to upgrade their skills, as well as to identify community resources and supports;

- determining collectively with Department of Education staff what programs are required based on the availability of resources;

- developing and delivering literacy and upgrading programs that meet the needs of adult learners by:

  - recruiting learner participants and carrying out individual learner assessments;- developing appropriate program models;

  - finding suitable locations and facilities for classroom-based programs;

  - scheduling sessions and promoting programs;

  - hiring, training and supervising instructors, tutors, and / or tutor coordinators;

  - providing professional development opportunities for Network staff and members;

  - evaluating programs and services; and

  - celebrating the success of learners.

- developing partnerships that provide space and equipment for training and access, plus in-kind or financial support and management expertise;

- administering the Department of Education's Program Grant and maintaining appropriate records for reporting to community stakeholders and the Department; and

- developing a clear vision to ensure long-term growth.

Delivery Models

The following models are eligible under CLI funding:

Coordination of a volunteer tutor program

Employing a tutor coordinator who matches volunteers with adult learners. The tutor coordinator supports, liaises with and conducts ongoing assessments of the matched pairs. A volunteer tutor program targets between 15-30 matched pairs.

Delivery of upgrading programs via group instruction

Employing a qualified instructor to conduct regular small-group or classroom-based sessions. A

group should target between 10-15 adult learners. This range can be adjusted to accommodate learners with special needs or in unique circumstances. A qualified instructor is someone who has either an education degree or equivalent educational training, plus experience in adult education.

Delivery of upgrading programs with family literacy component

The program must have as its primary objective the delivery of academic upgrading to adults and follow the Nova Scotia Academic Upgrading Curriculum. The number of adult participants in the program must be the same as in the 'group instruction' program model.

Funding

Annual provincial funding for CLI is $1.6 million. Approximately $1.4 million of this is used for grants to Learning Networks, and $200,000 for administration by the Department of Education.

Learning Networks apply for programming annually under the Program Grant. The Program Grant covers programming from September to June (up to a maximum of 40 weeks). This grant has three components: program delivery, administration and resources.

Program delivery covers salary cost of instructors and / or tutor coordinators. Salaries are based upon an hourly wage of $15.00. For instructors, 25% of their paid salary time may be used for preparation, including record-keeping. Benefits are set at 12%.

The administration component can be calculated up to 15% of the program delivery total. The 15% administration component is optional. If Networks wish to use a smaller percentage for administration they may. Administrative costs can cover administrative salary; photocopying; office supplies; telecommunications; transportation costs; bank charges; office or equipment rentals; and bookkeeping.

Educational Resources component can be calculated at 4% of the program delivery total to a maximum of $4,000.00. Educational resources may include print materials, audio visual resources, and educational software.

Professional Development Grant

The Community Learning Initiative also provides Professional Development Grants. This is to provide professional development opportunities to literacy practitioners (tutor coordinators,

instructors, and volunteer tutors) and Network members.

Reporting Structure

Each Learning Network has to submit an annual final report. Approval of the final report is one of the criteria used when the Department reviews the Program Grant application for the following year. Each Learning Network also has to submit a Learner Profile form for each learner that attends its CLI programs. These forms provide province-wide statistics of the adults who chose to upgrade their literacy and numeracy levels through the CLI.

Other Funding

Adult Basic Education Initiative

The Adult Basic Education Initiative (ABEI) is a comprehensive strategy to support learning and labour market attachment for adult Nova Scotians who wish to improve their literacy skills and/or obtain high school credentials. This strategy will ensure better coordination of literacy and upgrading programs in the province and will see the creation of a Nova School High School Diploma for Adults. The funding ($500,000) announced in the budget will support the development of an implementation framework that will include the advancement of program elements such as program development and assessment tools, recognition of prior learning, and possible options for funding and delivery.

Family Learning Initiative Endowment Fund

Family learning is an approach to education that recognizes the family as a learning unit and encourages parents and children to learn together. The Family Learning Initiative Endowment Fund is a partnership of the Halifax Youth Foundation, the National Literacy Secretariat of Human Resources Development Canada, and the Departments of Education and Community Services. The Fund is used to award grants to not-for-profit organizations in Nova Scotia working in support of family learning. The annual application deadline is usually set for mid-spring.

Labour Market Development Agreement

The Labour Market Development Agreement (LMDA), signed in 1997, provides a framework for the federal and provincial governments to work together in the area of labour market programs and services. Literacy, the Early Years (zero to 6) and Information Technology (IT) have been identified as the priorities for 2000-2001.

The Federal-Provincial Literacy Task Team, co-chaired by the Department of Education and HRDC, is composed of departments interested in addressing literacy as a foundation for lifelong learning and Nova Scotia's labour market success. Provincial representatives include the Labour Market Development Secretariat, the Departments of Education, Community Services, Economic Development, Health, Justice and the Senior Citizens Secretariat. Federal representatives include HRDC, the Atlantic Canada Opportunities Agency, Industry Canada and Health Canada.

The partners in the Agreement have recognized the need to address literacy as a means to fulfill their own mandates, whether it be to support economic diversification, to promote labour market attachment or to ensure that Nova Scotians can fully participate at home, at work and in the community. To this end, $4.5 million has been targeted for literacy to the four HRDC Regional Zones this year.

Strategic directions set by the Literacy Task Team include supporting family literacy, workforce skills development, and community-based literacy.

Workplace Education

Workplace Education is an essential skills program for working Nova Scotians sponsored by the Department of Education, the National Literacy Secretariat (NLS), HRDC, and business and labour. This program provides learning opportunities at the work site in the areas of reading, writing, math, oral communication, problem-solving and critical thinking skills.

Each year, eighty or more programs are initiated across the province. Each program is customized to the work site and can accommodate seven to 12 participants. Currently, programs take place in the construction, food processing, healthcare, information technology, manufacturing, municipal, natural resources, nonprofit and tourism sectors.

Standards for Quality Programs

Networks must also use the *Enhancing Program Quality: Standards for Community-Based Adult Literacy Programs* document as a guide for program planning and evaluation. Note that programs do not need to incorporate all the features stipulated in the document in order to meet the standards. Features will vary according to the types of programs delivered, the types of learners involved, and the availability of resources.

Tutor and Instructor Training and Certification Program

The Department of Education and Culture delivers a Tutor and Instructor Training and

Certification Program, a series of 10 workshops of 30-33 hours in total. This is currently being revised to address emerging needs, such as the use of technology in education. Other ongoing professional development is organized by the Department.

Program strengths

Those interviewed noted that the Community Learning Initiative continues to strengthen and develop in other areas, including:

- At both the provincial and community levels, infrastructure is developed through intergovernmental and private sector partnerships.

- CLI reaches remote communities and other under-served populations.

- Since the CLI is a provincially sponsored program, there is a commonality of mission, curriculum and resources which now pervades adult learning in this province. This, in turn, gives the Department of Education the potential for standardization and certification, thus increasing the provincial mobility of learners.

- CLI provides professional development activities and supports.

- CLI is flexible enough to accommodate many types of programs, from family literacy, to computer-assisted learning, to distance education. Learning Networks also provide flexibility in hours of instruction and time of instruction. The location of programs is based on the needs of the learners and uses learners' experiences and follows adult basic education principles.

Current challenges

Those interviewed cited the following challenges:

- There is no official recognition for the learning provided through the program. This will require a significant effort to implement program certification and learner assessments.

- Monitoring needs to be strengthened.

- There is a need for enhanced supports for tutors and recognition that there are some needs this approach cannot provide, such as help with multiple needs of the socially disadvantaged, and the difficulty of reaching rural dispersed populations. Volunteers are not seen as able to provide the services needed by learners at the higher levels.

- Multi-year funding is the preference but not possible in current fiscal climate. However, the program is now part of the department's core budget.

PRINCE EDWARD ISLAND

Organization structure

In 1996, the Province of PEI released *Tough Challenges: Great Rewards*, its strategy for adult literacy/education. The strategy document has guided the development of the current approach to community-based adult literacy programs. It set objectives for establishing literacy as a planning priority of government, a comprehensive approach to planning and delivery, certification of adult educators, and standards for programs. The Canada-PEI Labour Market Development Agreement includes literacy as one of three priorities.

The Department of Education provides funds, establishes standards and monitors and evaluates the program. They contract with The PEI Institute of Adult and Community Education, an affiliate of Holland College, to administer the program.

An advisory committee provides guidance to the Institute.

Delivery model

The Institute hires and trains instructors, contracts with community-based organizations for accommodations, and is responsible for program marketing. The Institute operates out of 18 community-based learning centres and rents these facilities from local organizations. These offer literacy and ABE programs plus other complementary programs (college preparation, life skills coach training, ESL).

Programs are offered either on a part time or full time basis depending on the community need. The original curriculum was adapted from the Newfoundland ABE curriculum. At the lower level, the standard is a ratio of 6:1 learners to instructor. At the higher levels the ratio is 10:1. The curriculum used at grades 10, 11 and 12 is the PEI high school curriculum.

Core standards for programs are in place, and recently a learning outcome approach to learner assessments was introduced. Instructors are required to have a PEI teacher licence, as well as a diploma and experience in adult education. They are paid $20 an hour by the Institute.

Other initiatives

Workers and children are the focus of two other initiatives of the provincial strategy.

Workplace Education PEI, an organization comprising the two levels of government, labour and business is leading the development of work place literacy and other programs. $200,000 is allocated annually to support program s in the workplace.

Initiatives in the school system involve volunteers helping students who have reading difficulties or who could be at risk of dropping out. Project LOVE (Let Older Volunteers Educate) has 200

volunteers working with elementary school children.

Research is being done on the barriers to seniors accessing literacy programs.

Funding

The Literacy/ABE program is funded annually at $1,224,000 through three sources:

$700,000   federal funds through the Labour Market Development Agreement

$300,000   Departments of Education, Health and Development each contribute $100,000

$224,000   for a night school program funded by the Department of Education

$20,000 is also provided annually to five Laubach Councils.

Strengths

Those interviewed saw the following strengths in the model:

- It links community-based programs well with the college system. The central delivery by the Institute helps assure standards are met, and provides access to various supports from the College. The Institute is not governed by collective agreements with instructors. This provides flexibility but also creates an issue of instructor job security.
- The Department is not involved in direct delivery, but plays a key role in leading policy development and building partnerships. Through its development of program support tools and evaluation work, it helps ensure the ongoing improvement of the program.
- There is strong support from various provincial departments.

Weakness

There are difficulties in attracting learners at the lower literacy levels. Only 10 percent of learners are at level one. A major public awareness/outreach initiative is now being developed with National Literacy Secretariat funding to tackle this issue.

MANITOBA

Organizational structure

Manitoba has developed a community-based approach to adult literacy, stemming from the recommendation of a provincial task force in 1989-90. The goal of the program is to deliver programming which contributes to the IALS definition of literacy for everyday living.

The Adult Literacy Program is managed and delivered by the Department of Education. A manager and three coordinators (reduced from an initial staff of ten), direct the program, provide assistance and professional development workshops, monitor program delivery, and participate in learner assessments. The Adult Literacy Program will soon come under a new branch that will bring together all provincial community-based programming.

Literacy Working Groups (LWGs) are formed at the community level, comprising either community representatives or agencies with an interest in literacy. They are advisory boards, responsible for conducting community needs assessments, promoting awareness of the need for programming, developing the local program, and managing all aspects of program implementation. Currently there are 40 LWGs, some of which operate multiple programs. There are no formal linkages among the adult literacy programs and the community colleges.

Under a separate program, Adult Learning Centres provide high school credits and certificates. The Province is now implementing a process to articulate the adult literacy, adult high school and college programs.

Other provincial departments do not play a formal role in the program.

Delivery Model

Most programs are part-time. Those in urban centres are usually offered in the day time, while those in rural areas typically offered in the evening. A curriculum is provided to guide the work of programs in individualizing the approach for each learner. Use of the curriculum is encouraged but not mandatory. Learners develop a portfolio, which measures growth (this was something that learners requested). The program is currently doing research to realign the curriculum with the IALS and national Essential Skills. The Department of Education issues certificates at each stage of progress through the program, based on an assessment by the coordinator and a meeting of departmental staff with the learner.

Most programs employ a paid coordinator or instructor and engage volunteer tutors.

Family literacy programs (fairly new in the province) are all tied to an established community-based literacy program. This helps ensure the goals of both prevention and involvement of adults are met.

Funding

The annual provincial budget is $1,213,500. This funds 40 programs, for an average of $30,300

per program. Salaries of instructors are $15 - $18 per hour. The province also provides funds for materials, technology, students supports, professional development, publicity. Most programs are located in the high schools, where space is provided free of charge. Funding is renewed annually to established programs based on a submission of a financial report, evaluation report, and a program development plan for the next year. There is no annual call for proposals.

Other supports

The Department has developed a series of guides for programs on conducting community needs assessments, quality programming (including the role of the LWG), program development, and managing volunteers. The Province delivers a series of mandatory workshops for the LWG boards, coordinators and instructors. Other optional workshops on specific topics are offered depending on needs (dealing with special needs learners, using learning technologies). Professional development has been cut back significantly as resources have been reduced.

A voluntary 18-hour Certificate Program for Instructors is also offered. Most programs encourage volunteers to participate in this also. Work is underway to develop this for delivery through correspondence and the Internet.

Attempts are made to use the NLS funding in a coordinated way so that tools and improvements are developed that will benefit more than one program.   For example, one program is taking the lead on designing a distance literacy program for the use of all programs that want it.   They are also looking at doing more extensive projects with the NLS funding in order to maximize the benefits across the system.

Strengths

Those interviewed cited the following strengths:

- The program is highly regarded in the community.
- The program is seen as very learner focused. This allows for flexible programming to meet needs. There is potential to articulate the program with others (such as those for Youth) and still preserve the flexible nature of the program.
- The active role of the Department in delivering workshops and monitoring programs helps maintain the quality of instruction.

Weaknesses

There is a perception among learners/potential learners that the program is not as good as that offered in the school. The articulation process will help overcome this. A study is underway on

the limitations of the programs for current learner needs. For example, more learners have employment goals now, and the lack of allowances and support with child are and transportation are seen as a barrier to meeting needs of those in the labour market.

There is variation in the strengths of the LWGs and self-evaluation process across programs, and this needs ongoing attention and support.

BRITISH COLUMBIA

Organization structure

Adult basic literacy/ABE programming is funded by the Ministry of Advanced Education, Training and Technology (MAETT), and delivered through the post secondary education system (colleges, university-college institutes and the Open Learning Agency). All institutions offer instructor-based literacy instruction (class and/or individualized). Smaller satellite campuses may have learning centres with individualized self-paced instruction. Several institutions also have their own volunteer literacy outreach programs (from base-funding). Some colleges deliver a literacy program in partnership with community groups. There is a broad range of such partnerships, from simple flow through of funding from the college to the community group, through to active use of the colleges' base funding to support community groups in delivering programming as an outreach program of the college.

The Ministry of Education (MOE) funds adult programs in school districts. Many school districts offer adult literacy programs through their adult learning centres.

Program model

The ABE program in the post secondary system consists of four levels and is articulated through to secondary graduation. The ABE Articulation Handbook sets out the learning outcomes expected of the program. Colleges are autonomous in terms of the resources and methods used to achieve these outcomes with learners.

Since 1994, MAETT and MOE have worked together in a Joint Committee on several ABE issues in response to Terms of Reference set out by their respective Ministers. The Committee initiated the ABE Transitions Project in 1998 to develop a more integrated learner-centred approach to ABE programming, with the specific objective of implementing a common credential for adults in order to facilitate transfer of learners among the institutions of the two public systems.

The significant policy outcomes of this joint approach over the years were:

- adoption of a policy of post secondary tuition-free ABE programming in May 1998. Note: it was already free in the school system for non-graduates;

- introduction of the British Columbia Adult Graduation Diploma (to take effect in September 1999), which replaced the former adult high school and ABE diplomas;

- improved articulation process between the post secondary ABE system and the adult school district programs;

- development of an ABE Accountability Framework primarily for Ministry use, and an ABE Program Quality Framework primarily for institutional program review;

- encouragement for the two systems to work together on a regional basis by asking for regional reports to be submitted to both Ministries and the offer of a $10,000 innovative grant for a small project for both systems to work on together.

Other initiatives

MAETT has other initiatives that post secondary institutions may apply for and may include literacy program components. One of these is Quick Response Training (QRT) which is aimed at small communities. Another is the Skills for Employment program (SEP) aimed mainly at the unemployed. Institution-based Training (IBT) and Expanded Capacity (EC) are initiatives within a special 'college envelope' to assist BC Benefits clients (income assistance recipients) in the transition from welfare to the post-secondary system. IBT provides counseling support whereas EC can provide additional seats in programs for these clients. Many of these clients will be the ABE/literacy programs. Financial support is available for books and transportation expenses for ABE students and income assistance clients.

Funding

More than $9 million is allocated this year for the delivery of the fundamental ABE level up to Grade 9 through the post secondary education system.   This is approximately 19.5 percent of the total ABE budget.

In addition, approximately $700,000 is allocated for grants for the adult literacy cost-shared program. This is a partnership program with the National Literacy Secretariat. Of this, approximately $400,000 goes to grants for community-based program delivery to about 20 programs per year. The National Literacy Secretariat puts another $908,000 into this cost-shared program for other literacy projects and about $75,000 for Literacy Corps.

13

The Ministry responsible for social assistance recipients, Ministry of Social Development and Economic Security, also provides funding to private organizations to deliver employment training and ABE.

Strengths

- The college system is seen by the program management as working well for this program. Colleges are autonomous but articulated, and not overly centralized.

- The presence of an ABE program in college satellite sites provides a core program that can position the college to offer other cost recovery programs.

- Accountability is seen to be strong. There are performance indicators in place and funding is linked back to capacity utilization. Regular performance reviews of each post secondary institution's college program also take place

- The ABE Accountability Framework developed last year acknowledged the importance of access, employability skills and life management skills as goals of ABE programs in addition to the more traditional academic skills.

Weaknesses

- Links between the college and community organizations delivering ABE are not always solid. Some community groups perceive the college as not being very responsive.

- There is a discrepancy in salary rates for college and community-based instructors which leads to some frictions.

- MAETT program personnel would like to encourage more active support and develop partnerships in other areas of government, such as those ministries responsible for family, workplace, justice and Aboriginal issues in literacy.

Conclusions

The four provinces profiled have each developed different approaches to delivering adult basic education and ABE. The degree of structure in delivery and consistency in program standards/expectations varies.

The key features of relevance for this evaluation are:

- Each developed their approach from some form of consultation or review of the need for adult literacy programming.

- Each developed an approach that was seen to be responsive to community and learner needs that was affordable within resources available.

- The lead Department in each case has been assigned and has carried out clear responsibilities for design and delivery of a program model.

- Tools for program planning, management and evaluation have been developed.

- Each has an established budget for this programming.

- Professional development and coordination services are resourced and seen as important to the program success.

- The degree to which community organizations play a role varies among the provinces.